



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

corripiendos et convincendos esse diversa sentientes—where *corripiendos* and *convincendos* refer respectively to the functions of rhetoric and dialectic, with the use of which Cresconius has charged Augustine.

G. L. HENDRICKSON.

SCHLICHER ON "THE MOODS OF INDIRECT QUOTATION"

Mr. Schlicher's suggestive paper in *Am. Jour. Phil.* XXVI, pp. 60 ff., deserves careful and detailed consideration. I shall not now raise the more obvious questions regarding the validity of his method in general, but desire briefly to call attention to two points of minor importance.

Much of the persuasive force of Mr. Schlicher's presentation arises from the circumstance that his theory so well fits the facts of German grammar that those who are imbued with the idioms of that language will be tempted to accept it. In striving for this result, however, he has exposed some vulnerable points. Obviously the theory arose from a study of the German construction. It fails when applied to the facts of Latin grammar. A moment's reflection will reveal how dissimilar are the facts of the construction in these two languages. In the German construction of indirect discourse—I speak chiefly of the older dialects—the mood, roughly speaking, answers the question: "Do I vouch for, or do I not?" In Latin it is entirely different. Here the mood determines whether the verb in question is felt to be included in the quotation or not. A theory that purports to explain the construction in both languages is inadequate if it fails to explain this vital difference. It will not be enough to answer that the difference is the result of a long specialization into diverse directions from a common source. That common source (as common it may have been) could hardly have been the simple psychological one suggested by Mr. Schlicher; for the difference here pointed out is a purely logical one.

Secondly, the examples cited from early Latin usually show a "repudiation," not of simple statements, but of commands and the like, in which one naturally expects the listener's immediate "rejection," "repudiation," or approval. *Non taces insipiens? Taceam?!* is very far from indirect discourse. Such examples can hardly be said to deal with "discourse" or matters of ordinary quotation. Though frequent in Plautus, they never once show a hint of developing a sentence similar to "*er wär ja heimgegangen*" used with the interpretation that Mr. Schlicher gives it. As for the German examples, in his eagerness to find a basis for his complex construction in the data of parataxis, is he not relying upon "simple" sentences that are of a secondary origin, sentences that possess a certain pseudo-simplicity, but derive to a large extent both form and connotation from the complexer and more explicit constructions? Certainly the tense of the verb in the example just quoted would indicate as much.

TENNEY FRANK.